

# **Royal Commission on Auckland Governance**

**Te Kōmihana a te Karauna mō te Mana Whakahaere  
o Tāmaki-makau-rau**

## **Report**

### **Volume 3: Summary of Submissions**

March 2009

[www.royalcommission.govt.nz](http://www.royalcommission.govt.nz)

Hon Peter Salmon (Chair) | Dame Margaret Bazley | David Shand

# Royal Commission on Auckland Governance

Te Kōmihana a te Karauna mō te Mana Whakahaere o Tāmaki-makau-rau

## Report

### Volume 3: Summary of Submissions

Author: Royal Commission on Auckland Governance

Publisher: Royal Commission on Auckland Governance

Place of Publication: Auckland

Date of Publication: January 2009 (Online); March 2009 (Print)

ISBN 978-0-9864509-4-5 (Print)

ISBN 978-0-9864509-5-2 (Online)

## Contact agency:

Royal Commission on Auckland Governance

[www.royalcommission.govt.nz](http://www.royalcommission.govt.nz)

Cover image: Martins Bay Holiday Park.

Cover and page design: pHd<sup>3</sup> limited, [www.phd3.co.nz](http://www.phd3.co.nz)

Editing and page layout: Barbara Hedley, Byword Pacific Ltd

Printing: Printlink, Petone.

# Royal Commission on Auckland Governance

## Commissioners

Hon Peter Salmon CNZM QC (Chair)

Dame Margaret Bazley DNZM Hon D.Lit.

David Shand

## Staff

Executive Officer: Heather Harris

Analysts: Neil Taylor

Bridget Romanes

Sally Garrett

Jane Glover

Debbie Edwards

Communications: Monique Oomen

Office Manager: Veronicah Hampton

Executive Assistant: Gaye Ingold

Hearings Coordinator: Jo-Anne Daly

Researchers: Harriet Kennedy

Nicola Kenward

Alexandra Dempsey

## Counsel assisting the Commission

David Kirkpatrick

## Consultant on Māori issues

Wharehuia Milroy

## Contents of Volume 3

<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
Purpose of this volume	1
Call for submissions process	1
Responses to submissions process	3
Profile of submitters	4
Form of submissions	5
Methodology	6
Hearings	7
Notes for Readers	7
<b>VISION FOR AUCKLAND</b>	<b>9</b>
<hr/>	
<b>2. Future Auckland – A Leading World-Class City</b>	<b>9</b>
Discussion of “world class”	9
Characteristics of a world-class city	11
<b>3. Values, Principles, and Characteristics of Local Government</b>	<b>19</b>
Democracy	20
Transparency	22
Accountability	23
Efficient resource use	28
Improved responsiveness	29
Improved community outcomes	30
Leadership	31
Connecting with decision makers	32
Subsidiarity	33
Identity and belonging	35
Consistency	38
Sustainability	38
Treaty of Waitangi	40
Other principles	41

---

<b>4. Councils, Councillors, Council Staff, and Consultants</b>	<b>43</b>
Keep the status quo	43
Councils' decision-making processes	45
Councillors and council staff	47
Local access to councils	53
<b>5. Specific Councils</b>	<b>55</b>
Auckland Regional Council	55
Rodney District Council	57
North Shore City Council	59
Waitakere City Council	60
Auckland City Council	61
Manukau City Council	62
Papakura District Council	63
Franklin District Council	65
<b>6. Regional Boundaries</b>	<b>69</b>
Keep the current boundaries	69
Shrink the region	69
Expand the region	70
Northern regional boundary	70
Southern regional boundary	71
<b>7. Local Government Representation</b>	<b>75</b>
Mayoral election – by public or by councillors	75
Concept of regional mayoralty	77
Executive powers for regional chair/mayor	77
Election of regional councillors	79
Local mayoralty	79
Number of councillors	80
Quality of councillors	82
Remuneration for councillors	83
Election or appointment of representatives	84
Voter turnout and the electoral system	85
Māori representation	88
Community boards representation	89
Community board comments	89
Ward representation on community boards	90

	Remuneration for community board members	90
	Miscellaneous comments	91
<b>8.</b>	<b>Community Boards</b>	<b>93</b>
	Support for community boards	93
	More powers for community boards	95
	Create more community boards	96
	Abolish some or all community boards	97
	Cost of community boards	99
	Community boundaries	99
	General comments on community boards	100
<b>9.</b>	<b>Consistency, Coordination, and Collaboration</b>	<b>103</b>
	Support for consistency	103
	Opposition to consistency	106
	Collaboration within Auckland	108
	Shared services	111
	Suggestions for improving collaboration	111
	Collaboration with Government	112
	Funding	115
<b>10.</b>	<b>Consultation and Communication</b>	<b>117</b>
	Community consultation and engagement	117
	Reasons for less consultation	118
	Consultation topics	119
	Costs of consultation	120
	Processes of consultation	121
	Council communication	121
	Miscellaneous points	123
<b>11.</b>	<b>Rates and Finance</b>	<b>125</b>
	Rates	125
	Alternatives to rates	128
	Other financial matters	128
	Future scenarios	129
<b>12.</b>	<b>Planning and Regulatory Functions</b>	<b>131</b>
	General comments about planning	131
	RMA and the Government's role	133
	Regional planning	134
	Territorial authority planning	136
	Other regulatory functions	138

Consistency	139
Strategic policy and planning	143
Long-term council community plans	146
<b>13. Environment</b>	<b>149</b>
Natural features	149
Volcanic cones	149
Harbours and waterways	150
Parks and reserves	152
Heritage	154
Architecture and urban design	157
Environmental governance	158
<b>14. Social Services and Community Development</b>	<b>161</b>
Social well-being	161
Equity and equality	163
Local responsibility	166
Regional responsibility	167
Housing	168
Education	169
Public health	170
Migrants	171
Elderly care	171
<b>15. Economic Development</b>	<b>173</b>
Economic strategies for Auckland	173
Economic analysis of local government activity	174
Local government economic development programmes	175
Regional management of economic development	177
Local management of economic development	178
Mix of regional and local management	178
Opposition to economic development programmes	180
<b>16. Infrastructure</b>	<b>181</b>
Perspectives on infrastructure problems	181
General approach to infrastructure management	182
Funding of infrastructure	185
Public participation in infrastructure management	186
Ports of Auckland and waterfront area	186
Broadband	189
Electricity	189
Solid waste	192
Miscellaneous infrastructure	193

<b>17. Transport</b>	<b>195</b>
Current governance arrangements	195
Problems other than governance	197
Case studies	197
Financial issues	198
Proposed transport models	199
Regional governance of public transport and roads	201
Local governance of public transport and roads	204
Road networks	205
Control of the railway	206
Public transport	207
Walking and cycling	208
<b>18. The Three Waters</b>	<b>211</b>
Effectiveness of current arrangements	211
Regional versus local decision making	212
Governance	214
Regulation	215
<b>19. Cultural and Recreational Facilities and Events</b>	<b>217</b>
Regional cultural facilities and events	217
Regional sports facilities and events	220
Local cultural and sports facilities	222
Funding of services and facilities	222
Administration of facilities	224
Māori consultation	224
<b>20. Emergency Management and Disaster Resilience</b>	<b>225</b>
Regional or local role	225
Funding	226
<b>FUTURE GOVERNANCE</b>	<b>229</b>
<hr/>	
<b>21. Future Allocation of Local Authority Functions: Regional, Local, Community</b>	<b>229</b>
Regional functions	230
Territorial authorities' functions	233
Community boards' functions and powers	235



<b>22. Proposals for Modifications to Present System</b>	<b>239</b>
Keep the status quo	239
Support for reorganisation	242
Strengthened regional council	242
Split councils into smaller units	243
Proposed amendments to the three-tier structure	244
Size of councils	246
<b>23. Proposals for Waiheke and Great Barrier Islands and Kaipara Harbour</b>	<b>247</b>
Waiheke Island	247
Great Barrier Island	250
Kaipara Harbour	252
<b>24. Council-Controlled Organisations and Other Commercial Entities</b>	<b>255</b>
Accountability of CCOs	255
Opposition to use of CCOs	257
Asset sales	259
<b>25. Māori Representation and Participation</b>	<b>261</b>
Treaty of Waitangi	262
Other legislation	265
Separate seats	266
No separate seats	268
Boundaries	268
Liaison and consultation	270
Specific iwi	272
Regional leader	273
Support for existing plans	273
<b>26. Pacific Peoples’ and Other Ethnic Representation</b>	<b>275</b>
Polynesian representation	275
Other ethnic representation	276
No special seats	277
Liaison and consultation	277
<b>27. Proposals for New Governance Structures</b>	<b>279</b>
Approach to change	279
Abolition of territorial authorities	280
Amalgamation of councils and one-council model	282
Opposition to “one city, one council” model	285

Two-tier structure: regional/local	289
New bodies for specialised purposes	295
<b>28. Statutory Reforms</b>	<b>299</b>
<b>29. Transition Processes</b>	<b>303</b>
Planning for change	303
Transition costs	305
Transition process	306
Legislative considerations	309
The future of Auckland	309
<b>Appendices</b>	<b>311</b>
Appendix A: Advertisement Calling for Submissions	312
Appendix B: Main Text of <i>Call for Submissions</i> Document	313
Appendix C: Submission Form	327
Appendix D: List of Individuals and Organisations Making Submissions	332
Appendix E: Abbreviations and Glossary of Local Government Terms	390
Appendix F: Glossary of Māori Terms	397