

Royal Commission on Auckland Governance

Te Kōmihana a te Karauna mō te Mana Whakahaere
o Tāmaki-makau-rau

Report

Volume 4: Research Papers

March 2009

www.royalcommission.govt.nz

Hon Peter Salmon (Chair) | Dame Margaret Bazley | David Shand

Royal Commission on Auckland Governance

Te Kōmihana a te Karauna mō te Mana Whakahaere o Tāmaki-makau-rau

Report

Volume 4: Research Papers

Author: Royal Commission on Auckland Governance

Publisher: Royal Commission on Auckland Governance

Place of Publication: Auckland

Date of Publication: March 2009

ISBN 978-0-9864509-6-9 (Print)

ISBN 978-0-9864509-8-3 (Online)

Contact agency:

Royal Commission on Auckland Governance

www.royalcommission.govt.nz

Cover image: Hauraki Gulf.

Cover and page design: pHd³ limited, www.phd3.co.nz

Editing and page layout: Barbara Hedley, Byword Pacific Ltd

Printing: Printlink, Petone.

Royal Commission on Auckland Governance

Commissioners

Hon Peter Salmon CNZM QC (Chair)

Dame Margaret Bazley DNZM Hon D.Lit.

David Shand

Staff

Executive Officer: Heather Harris

Analysts: Neil Taylor

Bridget Romanes

Sally Garrett

Jane Glover

Debbie Edwards

Communications: Monique Oomen

Office Manager: Veronicah Hampton

Executive Assistant: Gaye Ingold

Counsel assisting the Commission

David Kirkpatrick

Consultant on Māori issues

Wharehuia Milroy

Foreword

The Terms of Reference of the the Royal Commission on Auckland Governance (“the Commission”) required that, in carrying out its inquiry, the Commission use relevant expertise, and conduct its own research, where appropriate. This requirement reflects an intent that the Commission inquiry and report should be thorough and evidence-based.

The Commission cast a wide net for the most detailed and robust information and research available on all aspects of Auckland’s governance issues. There was a lot of relevant material, yet there were still some gaps in research. In order to ensure they had the most up-to-date information, the Commission requested various academics and specialists to write research papers on a range of topics, which are collated in this volume.

The subjects and style have a wide range, from the theoretical discussions on Auckland’s future and leadership, to the focused and detailed insights into the Resource Management Act, or the transport sector. Some research was commissioned to facilitate future planning, such as the papers on population and social issues. All have assisted the Commission in its inquiry.

The authors of the papers are people who have many years of practical experience in their field, with a depth of understanding of the issues and of the Auckland situation. The opinions expressed in these research papers are, however, those of the authors alone, and do not represent the Commission’s views or recommendations. Although efforts have been made to ensure accuracy, any errors are theirs.

All of these papers have also had further comment from peer reviewers. These comments were typically sent to the author and, where appropriate, amendments were incorporated into the original paper.

There are many challenges and opportunities for the Auckland region as it moves into the second decade of the 21st century. Informative research can only help guide the many decisions that are needed in the future, so the Commission is pleased to present this research volume to the people of Auckland.

Peter Salmon, Chairman

Margaret Bazley, Member

David Shand, Member

March 2009

Table of Contents

Foreword iv

Part 1 **Historical Overview of Auckland Governance** 1

1.	Introduction	3
2.	Auckland 1851–52 with “one-off” needs	3
3.	“Normal” in with the rest until 1920s	5
4.	Early special ad hoc metropolitan/regional arrangements	6
5.	“Greater Auckland” movement within procedural norms 1904–28	7
6.	Post-World War II: Throwing in the towel 1945–50	9
7.	Initial glimmerings of regional thinking (planning) 1946–58	11
8.	Formation of Auckland Regional Authority 1958–63	12
9.	Local Government Commission reactivated: the Auckland Area Scheme 1970–71	15
10.	The Local Government Act 1974 and implicit amalgamation	17
11.	Minimalism in the Muldoon era 1976–84	18
12.	Labour’s great leap for Auckland 1987–89	20
13.	Patterns of the 1990s: localism, metropolitanism, and regionalism	22
14.	Recent agitation for further reform of Auckland’s governance	24
15.	Evolution of local government functions in Auckland	25
16.	Central government’s evolving role	29
17.	Conclusion	32
	Appendix 1: General Functional Responsibility in Auckland	33
	Bibliography	35

Part 2 **Auckland’s Population** 39

	Summary	41
1.	Introduction	44
2.	Growth Expectations	44
3.	The Recent Record	45
4.	The Latest Projections	46
5.	Forecasting Contingencies	47
6.	Internal Migration	47
7.	International Migration	48
8.	Immigration and Ethnic Diversity	52
9.	The Implications of Diversity	53
10.	The Implications of Ageing	55
11.	Slower Labour Force Growth	56
12.	Changing Population Distribution	58
13.	Housing Need	59

14.	From Need to Demand	61
15.	Housing Affordability	62
	Conclusion	64
	Acknowledgments	64
	References	64

Part 3 The Composition and Scale of Auckland’s Economy 67

	Executive Summary	69
1.	Introduction	74
2.	Population	74
	2.1 Migration	77
	2.2 Natural Increase	79
	2.3 Summary	81
3.	Industrial Composition	81
4.	Economic Outcomes	85
	4.1 Employee Remuneration and Household Disposable Income	85
	4.2 Job Stability	87
	4.3 Industry-Specific Indicators	88
	4.4 Gross Domestic Product	89
5.	Auckland’s Economic Linkages	92
	5.1 Domestic Links	92
	5.2 International Links	94

Part 4 Drivers of Economic Growth in Auckland 101

	Executive Summary	103
1.	Introduction	107
	1.1 A Step Change?	108
	1.2 Outline of the Report	108
2.	Growth Theory and Evidence	109
	2.1 Theoretical Review	109
	2.2 Macroeconomic Empirical Evidence	111
	2.3 City-Level Analysis	113
	2.4 Microeconomic Evidence on Growth	115
3.	Agglomeration and Growth	116
	3.1 Local Evidence of Agglomeration Effects	118
	3.2 Intra-Auckland Effects	119
	3.3 Transport and Land-Use Issues	120
	3.4 Urban Form	121
4.	Innovation	122
	4.1 Risks of Innovation	123
	4.2 Measurement Issues	124

4.3	How is New Zealand Placed?	124
4.4	Attracting Innovators	126
5.	Potential Drivers of Growth in Auckland	127
5.1	National and Regional Policy Coordination	128
5.2	Specific Policy Areas	128

Part 5 **The Role of Local Government in Achieving Social Well-Being for the Auckland Region** **131**

This Report		133
Report structure		133
Executive Summary		134
1.	Social well-being in the New Zealand context	140
1.1	Social well-being and local government: the legislative and policy context	140
1.2	Current actors: their roles and activities	141
1.3	Current planning and priority-setting mechanisms and linkages	144
2.	Concepts of social well-being in New Zealand	146
2.1	<i>The Social Report</i>	146
2.2	Public health and social well-being	148
2.3	The four well-beings – social, cultural, economic, and environmental	149
2.4	Local government and social well-being	150
3.	Demography and statistics	152
3.1	Social well-being outcomes for Auckland	152
3.2	Auckland’s demography: a summary	157
3.3	Four critical social issues	160
4.	Effectiveness	164
4.1	Current local government structures and processes	165
4.2	Local authorities’ links with each other and with other key players in achieving social well-being	169
4.3	Serving the needs and interests of different population groups and communities in the Auckland region	172
4.4	Summary of stakeholder perceptions	179
5.	Future directions	180
5.1	Principles for the future	181
5.2	Broad options for roles and functions of local government	181
6.	Recommendations	187

Part 6 **Transport Governance in Auckland** **191**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY		194
1.	INTRODUCTION	202
1.1	Purpose and scope	202

1.2	Sources	203
1.3	Report layout	203
2.	BACKGROUND	204
2.1	Pre-1989 reforms	204
2.2	1989–1992 reforms	204
2.3	Expansion of the transport funding base	205
2.4	Organisational interactions	206
2.5	Engagement with central government	207
2.6	The Auckland Regional Transport Authority	208
2.7	Airport and port company ownership	209
2.8	Further legislative and policy changes	209
3.	CURRENT STATE DESCRIPTION	210
3.1	Statutory authorities active in Auckland	211
3.2	Other organisations and groups	215
3.3	Scale of local government operations	216
3.4	Transport rates	221
3.5	Regional plans and strategies	222
4.	TRANSPORT GOVERNANCE ISSUES	224
4.1	Fragmented decision making	225
4.2	Responding to future needs	226
4.3	Barriers to integration	228
4.4	The role of central government	228
4.5	Geographic context, skills, and capability	229
4.6	Mandate	230
4.7	Funding	231
5.	CASE STUDIES	233
5.1	Introduction	233
5.2	Regional arterial roads	233
5.3	Northern Busway	236
5.4	Passenger rail upgrade	237
5.5	Travel demand management	240
5.6	Road pricing	241
5.7	Integration of transport and land use	242
6.	INTERNATIONAL APPROACHES TO TRANSPORT GOVERNANCE	243
6.1	European Union	243
6.2	London	244
6.3	Canada	245
6.4	United States	247
6.5	Australia	247
6.6	Implications for Auckland	248
7.	GOVERNANCE PRINCIPLES AND EVALUATION CRITERIA	250
7.1	Transport governance principles	250
7.2	Evaluation criteria	253
8.	CONCLUSIONS	253
	Abbreviations	255

References	257
Appendix: Themes from previous work on transport governance in Auckland	259

Part 7 The Resource Management System in Auckland 261

1.	Introduction	264
1.1	Purpose of paper	264
1.2	Methodology	264
1.3	Terms of reference of Royal Commission	264
1.4	Restricted scope of paper	266
2.	The current resource management system in Auckland	267
2.1	Functionaries in the resource management system in Auckland	267
2.2	The key resource management instruments under the RMA	267
2.3	Implementation of the resource management planning system	275
2.4	The role of communities at different levels in the resource management system	279
2.5	Resource management instruments in the Auckland region	281
2.6	Delivery of resource management by Auckland councils	281
3.	Issues that any resource management system for Auckland must address	290
3.1	Methodology for issue identification	290
3.2	Growth management	291
3.3	Key infrastructure	294
3.4	The quality and state of the natural environment	295
3.5	Cultural environment	300
3.6	Amenity	300
4.	Informant views of resource management and governance issues for Auckland	305
4.1	Those involved in the resource management system in Auckland	305
4.2	The role of regional council	306
4.3	The current process for developing regional growth policy	307
4.4	Infrastructure must be planned regionally to support growth management and not lead or lag	307
4.5	Overlaps in key planning documents and functions	308
4.6	A strong and directive spatial plan is needed for the urban area	309
4.7	Urban redevelopment	309
4.8	Relationship between the rural area and the metropolitan area	310
4.9	Engaging the best talents in resource management	311
4.10	Harmonisation	312
4.11	Case studies	312
5.	Delivering a world-class city – the requirements of the resource management system	312
5.1	What is a world-class city region?	312
5.2	The RMA is unique to New Zealand	315
5.3	Elements required to deliver the resource management system	316
6.	A discussion of current issues and challenges – options for change	320

6.1	Possible governance models	320
6.2	Challenges and options	320
6.3	Evaluating governance options for Auckland from an RMA perspective	324
Appendices		327
Appendix 1A: Roles and responsibilities in Auckland		328
Appendix 1B: Requiring authorities under the Resource Management Act in Auckland region		333
Appendix 2: Commentary on key resource management instruments for Auckland region		335
Appendix 3: Legislation, national policy statements, and national standards that affect resource management in Auckland		339
Appendix 4: Documents and strategies relating to resource management issues		346
Appendix 5: Case studies		350
Appendix 6: The indicators used by the Mercer Survey in measuring quality of living		353

Part 8 **The Call for Integrated Planning** **355**

Summary		357
1.	Introduction	359
2.	Environmental Planning	359
3.	Infrastructure Planning	362
3.1	Past Arrangements	362
3.2	Coordinating Transport	363
4.	Economic Planning	365
4.1	The Metropolitan Auckland Project	367
4.2	The Regional Sustainable Development Forum	368
5.	The Argument for Integrated Planning	370
5.1	Why Reform Metropolitan Governance?	371
5.2	Issues around Integration	372
5.3	Where does Economic Planning Fit?	374
6.	Pursuing Efficiencies in Local Government	375
6.1	The Issues	377
6.2	Assessing Infrastructure Options	378
6.3	Overview	383
7.	Conclusions	384
References and Other Documents Consulted		385

Part 9 **Setting Community Boards in Context** **387**

1.	Preface	389
2.	Executive summary	390
3.	Community boards are a uniquely flexible vehicle	395

4.	Community boards and effective local government	400
5.	Community boards elsewhere in New Zealand	404
6.	Community boards in the Auckland region	409
7.	A framework for making community boards effective	423
8.	Community engagement in the absence of community boards	431
9.	Evaluation of alternative models	436
10.	Hauraki Gulf islands and rural areas	442
11.	Is there an optimum size for community boards?	444
12.	Addendum: Two tiers or three?	446
13.	Summary answers to questions posed in the brief for the project	448
	Appendices	451
	Appendix 1: Consultees and discussants	451
	Appendix 2: The Wanaka Community Board	453
	Appendix 3: Community Boards in Waitakere City: Wider Issues	461
	Appendix 4: Report to Palmerston North City Council, June 2008	469

Part 10 **Auckland Community Boards** **473**

Executive Summary	476
Findings from Council Survey	476
Findings from Community Board Feedback	477
Community Engagement and Consultation	478
Community Outcomes	478
Relationship between Community Boards and Councils	478
Background	479
Research Methodology	480
Key Findings from the Council Survey	481
Number of Community Boards	481
Coverage by Community Boards	482
Functions of Community Boards	483
Planning and Policy	488
Regulatory Functions	490
Resource Management Functions	492
Service Functions	493
Summary of Findings from Council Survey	500
Findings from Community Board Feedback	502
Key Achievements	502
Community Board Satisfaction Rating	503
Perceived Role of Community Boards	509
Summary of Findings from Community Board Feedback	510
Discussion	512
References	514

Part 11 **Civic Leadership for Auckland** **515**

Executive Summary	517
1. Introduction	520
2. The changing context for civic leadership	522
3. From government to governance	525
4. Understanding civic leadership	527
5. The modern city leadership agenda	535
6. Pointers for Auckland	543
7. Conclusion	547
References	547

Part 12 **Auckland 2060** **553**

Introduction	555
1. Methodology	555
Auckland 2060: methodology	558
2. Predictions	560
Big drivers of change	560
Impact of these drivers on New Zealand	563
Impact of these drivers on the Auckland region	565
3. Scenarios	568
New Zealand in 2060	568
Auckland 2060 scenario	575
Auckland Anniversary Day, Monday, 26 January 2060	576
Selected bibliography	590